

<b>Agenda Item</b> A9	<b>Committee Date</b> 12 December 2011	<b>Application Number</b> 11/00865/LB
<b>Application Site</b> Lancaster Girls Grammar School Regent Street Lancaster Lancashire		<b>Proposal</b> Listed Building Consent for the demolition of boundary wall to Queen Street, Lancaster
<b>Name of Applicant</b> The School Governors		<b>Name of Agent</b> Mr Frank McCabe
<b>Decision Target Date</b> 14 November 2011		<b>Reason For Delay</b> Increase in Officer caseload
<b>Case Officer</b>		Mr Andrew Holden
<b>Departure</b>		N/A
<b>Summary of Recommendation</b>		Approval

## **1.0 The Site and its Surroundings**

- 1.1 The application site is located within the Lancaster Conservation Area and currently forms the boundary between the Lancaster Girls Grammar School site and Queen Street. The boundary wall is considered to be a curtilage Listed wall to the neighbouring 12 Queen Street as it formed part of the garden to this property in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The boundary wall is approximately 2 metres in height and is constructed of random length regular sandstone. The wall has two entrances into the school grounds, a double timber gate to the north end of the wall for vehicular access and a stepped formal pedestrian entrance centrally located with a stone surround and pediment. A stone coping runs the full length of the boundary wall.

## **2.0 The Proposal**

- 2.1 The proposal is part of a much larger scheme (application 11/00852/FUL, the agenda item which preceded this application) which seeks to develop a three storey new sixth form building on the school site frontage with Queen Street. The development of the new building will require the demolition of the current coursed stone boundary wall which currently fronts the school site. The new scheme seeks to incorporate a new boundary wall of similar height and materials to the original with the upper two floors of the building built in differing stone 'floating' above the boundary wall.

## **3.0 Site History**

- 3.1 The school has an extensive planning history over the last 20 years the most pertinent of which are listed below:

<b>Application Number</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Decision</b>
<b>98/00473/FUL and 98/00467/LB</b>	Removal of existing classroom and erection of a two storey extension to provide classrooms	Permitted
<b>99/00168/FUL and 99/00184/LB</b>	Erection of extensions to provide an office, 2 classrooms and 3 practice rooms	Permitted
<b>03/00471/FUL and</b>	Conversion of roofspaces to teaching accommodation,	Permitted

03/00472/LB	construction of new staircase/enclosure, extension to existing staircase and construction of lift shaft	
05/00299/FUL and 05/00300/LB	Erection of classroom/study and store linked to main building	Permitted
0900746/FUL	Erection of a two storey extension to create drama/dance studio, fitness suite and office	Permitted

#### **4.0 Consultation Responses**

4.1 The following responses have been received from statutory and internal consultees:

Consultee	Response
<b>English Heritage</b>	The consultee has not responded directly to this application but has provided a wider response to the whole scheme incorporating the demolition of the curtilage Listed wall. The approach taken to developing the scheme has sought to replace the boundary wall with a replacement which maintains the appearance of a formal boundary wall to the site with a building 'floating' above it. This approach is considered to respond on the whole sympathetically to existing development on Queen Street.
<b>Conservation Officer</b>	<p>The Conservation officer has provided a comprehensive response in respect of the whole development which is broken down into specific elements. The comment in respect of the demolition of the curtilage listed wall stated: -</p> <p>Historical background - Queen Street was developed later in the 18<sup>th</sup> century with new houses being built in Queen Square and Queen Street. The site of the new building was occupied by two modest houses built in c.1820s These houses were demolished between 1957 and 1968. The property adjacent is a late 18<sup>th</sup> century house which was extensively altered and extended in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The boundary wall which fronts Queen Street formed part of a walled garden to the house and is part of the listed building. This building described as a Vicarage in c.1910 is now in use by LGGS. 4 and 6 Queen Street is the Registry Office a grade II Listed building of the late 18<sup>th</sup> century and 19<sup>th</sup> century.</p> <p>Demolition - The boundary wall will be demolished and is constructed of random length regular sandstone walling. Some of the stone is a reddened Permo Triassic stone intermingled with buff sandstone. There are also some buff sandstone quoins and good stone door opening surrounds and copings. Ideally the coping stones etc. should be reused where possible. The walling stone will be reused in the new building and this is acceptable.</p>

#### **5.0 Neighbour Representations**

5.1 No comments received during the statutory consultation period.

#### **6.0 Principal Development Plan Policies**

6.1 National Planning Policy Statement 5 (**PPS5**) - sets out the Governments aim to ensure that the historic environment and its historic assets should be conserved and enjoyed for the quality of life they bring to this and future generations. In order to deliver sustainable development, PPS5 states that polices and decisions concerning the historic environment should:

- Recognise that heritage assets are a non-renewable resource
- Take account of the wider social, cultural, economic and environmental benefits of heritage conservation
- Recognise that intelligently managed change may sometimes be necessary if heritage assets are to be maintained in the long term.

In this particular case policies HE6 (information requirements), HE7 and HE9 (development affecting heritage assets and relating to designated assets), HE10 (development affecting the setting of heritage assets) are relevant.

## 6.2 Lancaster District Core Strategy - adopted July 2008

Policy **E1** (Environmental Capital) - seeks to safeguard and enhance the Districts Environmental Capital by ensuring that development in historic areas conserves and enhances a sense of place. This policy also indicates that the Council will resist proposals which would have a detrimental effect on environmental quality and public amenity.

Policy **SC5** (Achieving quality in Design) - seeks to ensure that development proposals achieve the Core Strategy vision and that new development will be of a quality that enhances the character of the area, results in an improved appearance where conditions are unsatisfactory and compliments and enhances public realm.

## 6.3 Lancaster District Local Plan (saved policies) - adopted April 2004

Policy **E32** (Demolition of Listed Building) - seeks to ensure that demolition of all or part of a listed building is only permitted where it can be demonstrate that the rehabilitation is impractical. Exceptionally demolition may be permitted where redevelopment would produce substantial benefits for the community that would outweigh the resulting loss.

Policy **E33** (Alterations or extension) - seeks to resist the alteration of a listed building which would have an adverse effect on the special character or the buildings or their surroundings.

Policy **E35** (Conservation Areas and their Surroundings) - states that development proposals wh would adversely affect important views into and across a conservation area or lead to an unacceptal erosion of its historic form and layout, open spaces and townscape setting will not be permitted.

Policy **E37** (Demolition) - states that proposals to demolish any building within a conservation area will only be approved where detailed planning permission has been given for a scheme for redevelopment which would preserve and enhance the conservation area.

Policy **E39** (Alterations and Extensions in Conservation Areas) - states that alterations and/or extensions of buildings within the Conservation area will be permitted where; the proposal will not result in the loss or alteration of features which contribute to the special character of the buildings and area; and the design, scale, form, material and quality of the proposal is sympathetic to the character of the building and area.

## **7.0 Comment and Analysis**

7.1 The wider application to develop a three storey building at the site and the consequential loss of the original boundary wall has been the subject of pre-application discussion with the Conservation Officer and gained the support of the heritage consultees as part of the wider application consideration.

7.2 The wall is curtilage Listed, historically forming the garden boundary wall to the adjacent No. 12 Queen Street and is a heritage asset. Planning guidance recognises that such assets are a non-renewable resource and careful consideration should be given to the loss of such assets. Guidance also acknowledges that intelligently managed change may sometimes be necessary if the wider heritage assets are to be maintained in the future.

7.3 The scheme submitted under planning application 11/00852/FUL acknowledges the significance of the wall in providing historical context of the garden boundary to the site. The design of the new building has been undertaken in a way which will reinstate a formal boundary wall built on the same line and constructed of similar materials and scale to the original whilst enable a new building to be developed above.

7.4 Whilst the loss of the wall could not be supported in isolation, the development of a new building which incorporates a replacement wall in a form which reflects its historical nature is considered to be an acceptable approach to developing a new building whilst referring to the historical form of the

boundary. Suitable conditions would need to be attached to ensure the removal of the wall is not undertaken without the implementation of the scheme for the new sixth form building and that the stone walling and surrounds are kept and incorporated into the new building.

## **8.0 Planning Obligations**

8.1 There are no planning obligations to consider as part of this application.

## **9.0 Conclusions**

9.1 Whilst acknowledging the loss of this heritage asset it is considered that the proposed sixth form scheme will reinstate a formal boundary wall built on the same line and constructed of similar materials and scale. It will also enable a much needed educational building to be provided within the grounds of the school to serve to needs of the school for the future. Subject to conditions to ensure that demolition does not take place until a replacement scheme is approved and a contract entered into, the application should be supported.

## **Recommendation**

That Listed Building Consent **BE GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

:

1. Standard listed building consent
2. Works to be undertaken in accordance with the approved scheme
3. No buildings to be demolished until planning consent is granted for redevelopment and a contract for the works entered into
4. Site management plan for demolition
5. Hours of site clearance and demolition restricted 0800-1800 Mon to Fri and 0800-1400 Saturdays only
6. Reuse of stone and door surrounds to be incorporated within the approved building scheme

## **Human Rights Act**

This recommendation has been reached after consideration of the provisions of The Human Rights Act. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the issues arising do not appear to be of such magnitude to override the responsibility of the City Council to regulate land use for the benefit of the community as a whole, in accordance with national law.

## **Background Papers**

None.